

DESIGN REVIEW CHECKLIST: BUILDINGS - USQ D2.1 PRE-SUBMITTAL REVIEW

Date/Time:	Original meeting 8/20/2018 6:30 pm	Recommendation Due (45 days max)	October 4, 2018
Location:	Public Safety Building	Earliest Neighborhood Meeting (14 days min)	October 17, 2018
DRC Members in Attendance:	Sarah Radding, Jordan Smith, and Frank Valdes Deborah Fennick recused herself.		

Design review takes place prior the submittal of an application for development review. The purpose of design review is to provide guidance to the Applicant during the conceptual design phase of a development project and to assist in the selection of a preferred design for further design development.

6.7.5.D.4.c General Design Review Criteria - Buildings

Section	Design Guideline	N/A?	Vote	Recommended Design Modification or Additional Guidance
...ii.b.1.a	The prioritization of ground floor space for commercial uses rather than lobbies to upper story uses.	<input type="checkbox"/>	3 to 0 Yes	The quantity of proposed active uses appears favorable as does the large lobby for an office/lab building. More thought should be given to the design of the lobby and how it relates to the exterior circulation (this guideline is more appropriate for residential lobbies.) The utility spaces shown adjacent to the woonerf may not be appropriate for this location but more information is required. See also ...2.d.iii below.
...ii.b.1.b	The continuity of the street wall and spatial definition of the public realm by the building facade in relationship to neighboring buildings.	<input type="checkbox"/>	1 to 2 Not currently compliant	The building projection beyond the façade of D2.2 - partially impinging on the view toward the heart of Union Square - from the civic place should be redesigned. (See rendering on sheet A561 in D2.2 package.) The design of the SW corner should be a terminus to the civic space. See ...ii.b.1.c and ...2.d.iii below. The undercut of the first floor is a nice idea but too timid – it could extend along the whole Prospect St façade or be deeper or both.

...ii.b.1.c	The location, alignment, and massing techniques of high-rise elements to mitigate shadow impacts cast on nearby sites or on-site activities, reduce impacts on view corridors, and increase the actual or perceived separation distance between towers.	<input type="checkbox"/>	2 to 1 Yes	Provide rendering showing pedestrian view from sidewalk at eye level, looking north from southwest corner of building, similar to A203 but in front of D2.2. Revisit the massing as it is blocky (although efficient for lab buildings) to be designed in concert with the civic space and D2.2 and D2.3. Small subtractions of the rectangular development envelope have been proposed and could go further. It is important to note that the CDSP does not codify a "massing," but rather a "development envelope Sidewalk should be treated as an extension of the civic space."
...ii.b.1.d	The local microclimate including pedestrian level winds, weather protection, air quality, the reflection of sunlight, and the casting of shadows.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	— to —	Provide pedestrian wind study report for future submissions. A deeper overhang, suggested above, would provide better weather protection for pedestrians as the two principal frontages will be in shade most of the day.

6.7.10.H Architectural Design Guidelines

Section	Design Guideline	N/A?	Vote	Recommended Design Modification or Additional Guidance
...1.a.i	Building facades should be vertically articulated with Architectural Bays to visually break down and minimize the apparent mass of buildings, shorten the perception of distance/length, provide structure to the composition and disposition of fenestration, enhance pedestrian orientation, and add visual interest to the public realm.	<input type="checkbox"/>	3 to 0 Yes	Guideline met (see elevation drawings).
...1.a.ii	Architectural bays should be derived, in general, from the building's structural bay spacing.	<input type="checkbox"/>	3 to 0 Yes	Provide typical upper floor plan.
...1.a.iii	Architectural bays should have pilasters, columns, or piers that extend either all the way to the ground or to the cornice and sign band of ground level storefronts.	<input type="checkbox"/>	3 to 0 Yes	Guideline met (see elevation drawings).

6.7.10.H Architectural Design Guidelines

Section	Design Guideline	N/A?	Vote	Recommended Design Modification or Additional Guidance
...1.a.iv	Architectural bays should align, in general, with individual or groups of storefront and lobby entrance frontages of the ground story of a building.	<input type="checkbox"/>	3 to 0 Yes	Guideline met (see elevations).
...1.a.v	Building facades should be horizontally articulated with a clearly defined base, middle, and top. Visual differentiation between the base, middle, and top should be achieved using a cornice, band, or other architectural features(s) that visually indicates a horizontal line of expression and creates surface relief, depth, and shadow.	<input type="checkbox"/>	3 to 0 Yes	Guideline met (see elevations).
...1.a.vi	In most circumstances, the vertical buttresses, pilasters, columns, or piers of Architectural Bays should always project further and be uninterrupted by any horizontal elements of a façade, excluding the cornice, band, or other architectural feature(s) used to differentiate the base, middle, and top of a building from one another.	<input type="checkbox"/>	3 to 0 Yes	This guideline appears to be met, although it is not necessarily applicable to a curtain wall building.
...2.b.i	Changes in fenestration patterns should be used to help differentiate the base, middle, and top of buildings.	<input type="checkbox"/>	3 to 0 Yes	Guideline met (see elevations).
...2.b.ii	Within the base, middle, and top of a building, Fenestration should align vertically within each architectural bay and horizontally across each story of a building.	<input type="checkbox"/>	3 to 0 Yes	Guideline met (see elevations).

6.7.10.H Architectural Design Guidelines

Section	Design Guideline	N/A?	Vote	Recommended Design Modification or Additional Guidance
...2.b.iii	Upper stories should have a window to wall area proportion that is lower than that of the ground floor.	<input type="checkbox"/>	3 to 0 Yes	Proportion of glass to solid on typical upper floors is smaller than at ground level storefront. Guideline met.
...2.b.iv	Windows should be punched into walls and glass should be inset from exterior wall surfaces.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	__ to __	Not applicable. This appears to be a curtain wall building.
...2.b.v	Series of windows set side by side to form a continuous horizontal band across a facade (aka 'ribbon windows') should be avoided.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	__ to __	Not applicable. This appears to be a curtain wall building.
...2.b.vi	Solid wall materials should be used to frame groups of windows to reduce the perceived scale of a building.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	__ to __	Not applicable. This appears to be a curtain wall building.
...2.c.i	The palette of wall materials and colors used for a building should be kept to a minimum, preferably three. Similar wall materials as found on adjacent or nearby buildings should be used to strengthen district character and provide continuity and unity between buildings of divergent size, scale, and architectural styles.	<input type="checkbox"/>	3 to 0 Yes	The proposed palette appears to include at least three materials (stone, glass, metal), with variations. However, this is a large building so this number of materials is suitable for a building of this scale. Quality of materials and detailing will be critical for review later in process. Show actual material samples as design develops.
...2.c.ii	Acceptable wall materials include architectural concrete or precast concrete panels, natural or cast stone, curtain wall and heavy gage metal panel, and brick. Value added materials such as natural or cast stone, concrete, glazed or unglazed architectural terracotta, and brick should be used as wall materials where pedestrians closely encounter and interact with buildings.	<input type="checkbox"/>	3 to 0 Yes	Good palette of materials but will be reviewed again in the process. More detail should be provided about the "stacked masonry" called out on sheet A307 to understand what is intended. Terracotta, more appropriate to panelized construction, could provide this texture and detail.

6.7.10.H Architectural Design Guidelines

Section	Design Guideline	N/A?	Vote	Recommended Design Modification or Additional Guidance
...2.c.iii	Exterior Insulation and Finish Systems (EIFS) should never be used for the base of a building.	<input type="checkbox"/>	3 to 0 Yes	No EIFS proposed. Guideline met.
...2.c.iv	Horizontal or vertical board siding and shingles, whether wood, metal, plastic (vinyl), masonry, or composite materials, should only be used for smaller scale apartment buildings.	<input type="checkbox"/>	3 to 0 Yes	No board siding or shingles proposed. Guideline met.
...2.c.v	Two or more wall materials should be combined only one above the other. Wall materials appearing heavier in weight should be used below wall materials appearing lighter in weight.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	__ to __	Not applicable. This appears to be a curtain wall building.
...2.c.vi	Building wall materials that are lighter in color, tint, or shade should be used for the lower floors of a building, with materials darker in color, tint, or shade used above.	<input type="checkbox"/>	3 to 0 Yes	The renderings appear to propose a consistency of shade across upper and lower portions of building. This is suitable given the variation in texture being proposed.
...2.c.vii	If a building's massing and pattern of fenestration is complex, simple or flat wall materials should be used; if a building's massing and pattern of fenestration is simple, walls should include additional texture and surface relief. Side and rear building elevations that are visible from the public realm should have a level of trim and finish that is compatible with the façade of the building.	<input type="checkbox"/>	3 to 0 Yes	Guideline met: the building's massing, pattern of fenestration, and the proposed wall surface includes texture and surface relief. Good complexity of fenestration.

6.7.10.H Architectural Design Guidelines

Section	Design Guideline	N/A?	Vote	Recommended Design Modification or Additional Guidance
...2.c.viii	Side and rear building elevations that are visible from the public realm should have a level of trim and finish that is compatible with the façade of the building.	<input type="checkbox"/>	3 to 0 Yes	Level of finish appears to be the same on all facades.
...2.c.ix	Balconies should have either metal railing or glass guardrail systems.	<input type="checkbox"/>	3 to 0 Yes	Guideline met (see elevation drawings).
...2.d.i	The design of storefronts should invite interaction, enliven the pedestrian environment, and provide a secondary, more intimate source of lighting at night.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	__ to __	Insufficient information to evaluate at this time – requires more detail for review later in process.
...2.d.ii	Monotonous and repetitive storefront and sign designs and types should be avoided.	<input type="checkbox"/>	3 to 0 Yes	Guideline met. Storefront bays are related to building structural bays but vary. See sheets A308, A309.
...2.d.iii	Where a pedestrian street intersects with a side street, commercial spaces should wrap the corner and include at least one storefront bay on the side street.	<input type="checkbox"/>	3 to 0 Yes	As mentioned above, the relationship of the street-level space at the SW corner to the civic place and woonerf should be studied further. The doors (directly opposite the corner of D2.2) into the space are too far east to address the civic space successfully. This could be a good location for an indoor civic amenity, but it would need to be given a more thoughtful relationship to the civic space. Architecturally, the column at the SW corner is odd when compared to the glass corner at Prospect/Somerville Ave – it should be equally permeable.
...2.d.iv	A paneled or rendered stallriser at least one (1) foot in height should be included below display windows.	<input type="checkbox"/>	3 to 0 Yes	Guideline appears to be met, though stallriser is not dimensioned See sheets A308, A309.
...2.d.v	Where height permits, transom windows should be included above storefront doors and display windows to allow additional natural daylight to penetrate into the interior space.	<input type="checkbox"/>	3 to 0 Yes	Guideline met (see elevation drawings).

6.7.10.H Architectural Design Guidelines

Section	Design Guideline	N/A?	Vote	Recommended Design Modification or Additional Guidance
...2.d.vi	Awnings are encouraged for each storefront to provide weather protection for pedestrians and reduce glare for storefront display areas. Awnings should be open-ended, and operable.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	__ to __	Not applicable at this time. This topic is appropriate for exploration later in the design process.
...2.d.vii	Bi-fold glass windows and doors and other storefront systems that open to permit a flow of customers between interior and exterior space are encouraged.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	__ to __	Not applicable at this time. This topic is appropriate for exploration later in the design process.
...2.e.i	Principal entrances should be optimally located, well defined, clearly visible, and universally accessible from the adjacent sidewalk.	<input type="checkbox"/>	1 to 2 Not currently compliant	The principal entrance on Prospect Street is sensibly located but could be more prominent. For a building of this size, it seems awkward not to have an entrance on Somerville Ave. A building with this program, size and location should be much more porous, with the ground floor designed to encourage people to walk through it. Indoor semi-public space will be well-used during the cold months and can serve to increase traffic to retail and restaurant tenants. Study the plan if the large retail space on Somerville Ave would be divided in two - there would be no way to access the easterly half from inside the building.
...2.e.ii	Each ground floor use should have an individual entrance with direct access onto a sidewalk.	<input type="checkbox"/>	3 to 0 Yes	This guideline is met for the 2 retail spaces. Bicycle parking and showers are well-located relative to the side entrance. However, the number of spaces should be supplemented by adjacent exterior bike parking. Provide a labeled floor plan showing names of service space, info about assumed occupant loads, and bike parking spaces provided. This guideline does not apply for the unidentified service spaces adjacent to the woonerf but as shown the windowless spaces with single doors will detract from the character of the outdoor space.
...2.e.iii	Storefront doors should not obstruct pedestrians walking past or alongside a building.	<input type="checkbox"/>	1 to 2 Not currently compliant	The doors into the retail space south of the lobby on Prospect Street may be in conflict with the sidewalk – more development of the sidewalk design is needed to evaluate this condition.

6.7.10.H Architectural Design Guidelines

Section	Design Guideline	N/A?	Vote	Recommended Design Modification or Additional Guidance
...2.e.iv	Lobby entrances required for upper story uses should be limited in width (frontage) and separate from the entrance for any ground floor uses.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	__ to __	This guideline is more appropriate for a residential building with ground floor commercial.
...2.e.v	Features such as a double-height ceiling, distinctive doorway, decorative lighting, recessed façade, or a change in paving material within the setback area should be used to make lobbies for upper story commercial uses distinctive while preserving floor space for other ground floor uses.	<input type="checkbox"/>	1 to 2 Not currently compliant	In the elevations, the main entrance is not readily distinguishable from the adjacent storefronts, despite being slightly recessed and having a larger canopy. The sidewalk design at the Prospect St façade should be further developed both to respond to this guideline, and to better integrate into the civic space.
...2.f.i	Exterior lighting (building, storefront, and landscape) should be integrated into the design of the building, create a sense of safety, and encourage pedestrian activity at night through layers of light that contribute to the nighttime experience.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	__ to __	Concept imagery (L300, L301) provides insufficient detail to evaluate at this time. Condition for later review.
...2.f.ii	Exterior lighting should relate to pedestrians and accentuate major architectural or landscape features, but should be shielded to reduce glare and eliminate light being cast into the night sky.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	__ to __	Concept imagery (L300, L301) provides insufficient detail to evaluate at this time. Condition for later review.
...2.f.iii	The upper portions of buildings, especially high-rise buildings, should provide visual interest and a variety in detail and texture to the skyline.	<input type="checkbox"/>	0 to 3 Not currently compliant	The cut out volume at the NW corner provides some visual interest and detail. More detail about the proposed design is needed at the penthouse and the mechanical equipment screen.

6.7.10.H Architectural Design Guidelines

Section	Design Guideline	N/A?	Vote	Recommended Design Modification or Additional Guidance
...2.f.iv	Mechanical and utility equipment should be integrated into the architectural design of the building or screened from public view. Penthouses should be integrated with the buildings architecture, and not appear as foreign structures unrelated to the building they serve. The proportion of screening to the rest of the building should be taken into consideration.	<input type="checkbox"/>	0 to 3 Not currently compliant	Given the visibility of this rooftop from nearby, the roof should be given more consideration. While mechanical equipment is not visible from the street below, the proposed perimeter screening will allow an unobstructed view of the rooftop equipment from Prospect Hill.
...2.f.v	To every extent practicable, rooftop mechanical equipment should be centered in the roof area to limit its visibility from adjacent thoroughfares. Consideration should be given to the tradeoffs of individual or bundled stacks and requirements of uses internal to the building.	<input type="checkbox"/>	0 to 3 Not currently compliant	Not enough documentation has been provided to evaluate this. See ...2.f.iv.
...2.f.vi	Ventilation intakes/exhausts should be located to minimize adverse effects on pedestrian comfort along the sidewalk and within outdoor spaces.	<input type="checkbox"/>	0 to 3 Not currently compliant	It is unclear whether this guideline has been met. Full height mechanical intakes/exhausts should not be employed at ground level in this building given the amount of pedestrian circulation that will happen on all sides. Design team to clarify 4 overhead rolling doors shown on elevations but plan shows only 2.
...2.f.vii	Buildings at terminated vistas should be articulated with design features that function as focal points to create memorable views that add to the character and enhance the aesthetics of the neighborhood.	<input type="checkbox"/>	0 to 3 Not currently compliant	See ...ii.b.1.b above.

6.7.10.H Architectural Design Guidelines

Section	Design Guideline	N/A?	Vote	Recommended Design Modification or Additional Guidance
...2.f.viii	Architectural details, ornamentation, and articulations should be used with building fenestration to create a harmonious composition that is consistent throughout the building, so that the building appears as a unified whole and not as a collection of unrelated parts that adds to the impression of bulk.	<input type="checkbox"/>	3 to 0 Yes	Palette is consistent - guideline met (see elevation drawings).
...2.g.i	Parking spaces of the top floor of any above ground parking structure should be fully enclosed within the structure or, if unroofed, substantially covered by solar panels. When parking is fully enclosed within a structure, a green roof or athletic field is encouraged on the roof.	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	__ to __	

Attest, by the Design Review Committee

Frank Valdes, Interim Chair

